Tenure at University of Wisconsin-Madison and University of Wisconsin Extension

*Concepts and Pathways for Integration*

(Tenure Working Group of Madison-Extension Governance Integration Committee, 5/1/2018)

**Preamble**

Last fall, without significant consultation of the faculty at UW-Madison, the UW Colleges and other UW Campuses, and University of Wisconsin Extension (UWEX), UW System President Ray Cross proposed sweeping institutional restructuring affecting all of these UW institutions. The proposal was quickly approved by the UW System Board of Regents, and among other features called for the movement of over 120 tenured and tenure track faculty from UWEX to UW-Madison, officially effective July 1, 2018. This document summarizes the work of the *tenure working group*, four faculty from each institution charged by the Madison-Extension Governance Integration Committee to: review Board of Regent resolution 10956, generate background information to aid in subsequent deliberations, identify key tenure-related issues in integration of UWEX faculty, generate potential methods to reconcile differences and provide entry pathways, and communicate with governance bodies.

**Recommendation**

For the singular event of UWEX joining UW-Madison, the consensus recommendation of the tenure working group is that UWEX faculty should retain the tenure and rank they have earned. These faculty will then follow UW-Madison policies and procedures for post tenure review and promotion to full professor. After this one time institutional transfer of tenure, UWEX tenure track faculty will have to earn tenure following UW-Madison policies and procedures and meet standards expected of all other UW-Madison faculty.

**Background**

A *brief introduction to extension faculty and their roles and responsibilities*

UWEX has about 120 tenured faculty and a few tenure-track faculty, who hold M.S. or Ph.D degrees. UWEX has had faculty since it was proposed in 1891, hired the first county faculty in 1912, expanded beyond agriculture in 1957, and became a separate institution in 1965. Since February of 2017, all new UWEX hires have been academic staff positions. Some faculty have connections to four-year campuses, work in units with research functions such as Wisconsin Geological and Natural History Survey, or function similar to academic departments such as the School for Workers. County-based positions throughout the state are a mixture of faculty and academic staff, with some overlap in activities and roles. Tenured and tenure track county faculty may be called 'agents' or 'educators' depending on the audience they are teaching. Agent and Educator is the historic brand identifying a trusted local person from the county UW-Extension Office providing instruction, conducting locally relevant research, and extending research-based information from UW campuses, as opposed to someone from a K-12 school district, a technical college, or a college campus.

UW-Madison has about 63 faculty (tenured and tenure-track) whose positions are partially supported with UWEX funds (10 to 80%, with the majority being 60% or more). These faculty are considered ‘extension specialists’ or ‘state specialists’. They conduct applied research relevant to the needs of
Wisconsin, develop educational materials explaining how to use this new information to make more informed decisions (e.g., agricultural practices to improve farm profitability and environmental sustainability), deliver educational seminars and training throughout the state, and provide specialized consultation to individuals, businesses, and government. Extension specialists work with county agents/educators to fulfill the Wisconsin Idea. In addition, UW-Madison employs about 50 academic staff, who comprise about 26 FTE on UWEX funds, with roles as regional or state extension specialists.

Tenure Concepts – What is tenure?
In a legal sense, it is a guarantee of a continued academic position. Following a change in 2016 which removed state statute provisions for tenure, the guarantor is the Board of Regents (BoR) of the UW System,\(^1\) using essentially the same language as previously embodied in statute.

What are the rights and values associated with tenure?
- Job security: In general, tenured faculty operate on the assumption of permanent retention. UW System language includes provisions for abrogating tenure in the cases of declared financial exigencies, program discontinuance, significant malfeasance or failure to carry out obligations.

- Academic freedom: A conceptual and historic basis for tenure is the notion that scholars need to be free to express (say, publish, teach, etc.) ideas, beliefs, and truths they consider important. In contemporary academic institutions, this concept is not limited to tenured faculty. All members of academic communities should feel that the institution respects and protects this right. UWEX county faculty (funded in part through agreements with county governments) note that they are vulnerable to withdrawal of county support for controversial expressions but their positions and associated academic freedom are protected by University of Wisconsin tenure.

- Titles: The title of professor is considered prestigious, conveying a notion of someone with advanced education and deep knowledge of a field. At UW-Madison and UWEX, the titles Associate Professor and Professor\(^2\) are used exclusively by tenured faculty, and Assistant Professor is used for tenure-track faculty. These are the only category of employees that comprise faculty of the university. Two other titles – research professor and teaching professor are currently under consideration at UW-Madison; however, these would be academic staff positions, not faculty.

- Faculty rights: The authorities and responsibilities of UWEX and UW-Madison faculty are described in State Statute 36.09(4). Additional rights are itemized in UW-Madison Faculty Policies and Procedures section 1.20 (C) and UWEX Articles of Faculty Governance. Rights for UW-Madison faculty that would be different than most Extension faculty are related to student interactions such as establishing requirements for admission and graduation, student misconduct and discipline, developing academic programs and associated curricula, and mentoring and advising. Rights shared

---

\(^1\) Regent Policy 20-23 specifies that a “‘tenure appointment’ means an appointment for an unlimited period granted to a ranked faculty member by the board [of Regents].” The board “may grant a tenure appointment only upon the affirmative recommendation of the appropriate chancellor and academic department or its functional equivalent” (with a provision for bypassing departments when tenure denial was based on impermissible factors).

\(^2\) The School of Medicine and Public Health has a system of tenure for Clinical Health Science Professors, though these are technically academic staff positions.
between Madison and Extension faculty include participation in shared governance, procedures for recruitment, appointment, review of faculty colleagues, establishing independent research and/or programming, and automatic principal investigator status, though details of how these rights are executed by each organization differs.

Similarities and Differences Between UW-Madison and UWEX Faculty
Most UW-Madison faculty have obligations in research, instruction, and service. In some units, outreach is considered a component of service; in others, it is a separate activity area. Specific duties are spelled out at the department level, and broad expectations are described and enforced through tenure evaluation at a campus-wide level (Divisional Committees). Post-tenure review is conducted primarily at the department level, with review by deans. The provost is responsible for oversight of the overall process and resolving differences between those two levels of review. Some faculty are state specialists partially supported with UWEX funds; they may teach on the campus of their appointment and some of the academic staff state and regional specialists lead applied research activities.

Most UWEX faculty have outreach as a primary activity and have applied or locally relevant research projects that may be conducted in conjunction with extension specialists or other campus-based faculty. Specific duties are spelled out at the department level, and broad expectations are described and enforced through tenure evaluation at the division level. In general, they do not participate in university credit-bearing instruction, though they may conduct training and teach classes with other forms of credit such as CEUs. Some faculty teach or co-teach existing courses on the Madison campus. As specified in UWEX Articles of Faculty Governance Appendix I.C, assessment of scholarship is based on four themes: “creative, intellectual work; reviewed by the scholar’s peers who affirm its value; added to our intellectual history through its communication; and valued by those for whom it was intended.”

Tenure Evaluation
The processes for evaluating probationary faculty are substantially similar for UW-Madison and UWEX. In both cases, a recommendation is made at the department level. This decision is reviewed by an institution-wide committee (Divisional Committee for UW-Madison, Faculty Tenure Advisory Committee for UWEX), then by a dean, the Provost and Chancellor, all advisory to the BoR which confers tenure. As might be expected given different roles and expectations between UW-Madison and UWEX faculty, the nature of evidence included in a tenure dossier and the criteria used to evaluate it are similar, but not identical. Some notable differences include:

- The type of external letters in the dossier: UW-Madison Divisional Committee guidelines specify at least five “arms-length” letters from knowledgeable professionals that have not collaborated with a candidate. UWEX letters are from people familiar with the candidate’s work, including collaborators and Extension colleagues, though details of required letters vary by department.

- The role of deans in the tenure process: At UW-Madison, deans generally accept the recommendation of departments and Divisional Committees; they tend to be actively involved only in unusual circumstances or during an appeal. Deans at UWEX make tenure recommendations to the Provost, who then makes recommendations to the Chancellor. Recent reorganization of Cooperative Extension (referred to as the nEXT Generation Model) made substantial changes in county-based
faculty positions, which included requesting that recent county-based tenure-track hires convert to an academic staff position or receive a termination of employment letter.

Post Tenure Review
Post tenure review (PTR) is required by UW System; each institution develops and implements a policy that meets sixteen requirements described in the Regent Policy Document 20-9. Since the BoR adopted this policy in December 2016, both institutions have revised existing PTR procedures. In both, the review is done by the executive committee of a department or department-equivalent, based on departmental criteria. At UW-Madison the outcome of the evaluation is reviewed by the appropriate dean, and in most cases concludes at this level. At UWEX, the post-tenure review materials are reviewed by the dean, Provost and Chancellor.

While the mechanism for aligning PTR procedures is beyond the immediate charge of the Tenure Work Group, it is described above because UWEX faculty will be governed by UW-Madison procedures in the future. It is clear that “such review shall not infringe on existing faculty rights and protections” (BoR, 20-9) and “post-tenure review is not a re-evaluation of tenure” (UW-Madison Faculty Policies and Procedures, 7.17). However, after joining UW-Madison, former UWEX faculty will go through UW-Madison’s existing PTR procedures and structure, with department-level criteria appropriate to their unit, just as all other Madison faculty.

Options and Recommendation
The following describes options members of the Tenure Working Group considered for the incorporation of tenured UWEX faculty into UW-Madison after the institutions are joined. These options are based on the BoR resolutions and amendments that Cooperative Extension will be incorporated “as a component part” of UW-Madison, in a new school, and that the School for Workers will be incorporated into Division of Continuing Studies. The recommended option is the only one that does not lead to a tenured employee of the UW-System losing tenure while remaining in their position. We have agreed by consensus that this is important to the protection of faculty tenure rights at UW-Madison, and throughout the UW System.

Recommended Option
- Recognition of UW-Extension Tenure: All UWEX faculty retain their current rank and tenure in transition to UW-Madison. This is based on the observation that tenure was granted to them by the BoR, as well as language in the restructuring resolution (BoR, Resolution 7, 11/07/17): “…Extension employees who become employees of a UW System campus or UW System Administration shall continue to enjoy job security rights and shared governance rights consistent with their current appointment.” This approach would require compliance with UW-Madison policies and procedures in all aspects of faculty rights and responsibilities including post tenure review and promotion to full professor. This option preserves tenure commitments made to Extension faculty who are already UW employees, and who have been reviewed by faculty peers in their current departments and granted tenure on that basis. It also preserves the concept that once tenure is granted it may not be revoked or reconsidered without dismissal for cause. This option is considered to provide an equitable transition process that builds on the strengths of both institutions.
Options Considered But Not Recommended

- Title conversion: All UWEX faculty could be converted to academic staff with long-term horizons, with the exception of a small subset that seek to earn tenure based on standard UW-Madison criteria and procedures. This option is based on Regents' Policy 20-23 that BoR grants tenure “only upon the affirmative recommendation of the appropriate chancellor and the appropriate academic department...” UW-Madison expects that all new faculty from outside the institution, including senior administrators such as deans, undergo a rigorous evaluation of their academic record through a full tenure case. This option maintains the sanctity of UW-Madison tenure processes but is highly inequitable to UWEX faculty who earned tenure based on different criteria and are now faced with de-tenuring due to circumstances over which they had no control or even input. In addition, the UWEX Faculty are not new faculty who have chosen to apply for a faculty position at UW-Madison. UWEX faculty will be continuing with the same job they had as an associate professor or professor.

- Immediate option pathway: Upon transition, UWEX faculty would be given a choice of 1) conversion to job-secure academic staff, 2) assemble a tenure case for appointment as associate or full professor (within a reasonable period such as a year), or 3) receive an appointment as an assistant professor with a two to six year tenure clock. An additional consideration to recognize professional achievement of faculty that opt to convert to academic staff could be creating a title series such as Extension Professor. It would also be important for UW-Madison governance to work with departments and divisional committees to develop reasonable criteria for evaluating extension faculty. Unfortunately, this approach is essentially a removal of tenure and requires faculty to assemble tenure dossiers and return to tenure track positions for a second time, which would be highly inequitable. There are currently no policies on either campus for creating criteria to re-evaluate faculty tenured by the BoR in one institution that are transferred by the BoR to another institution.

- Deferred option pathway: UWEX faculty are granted provisional tenure upon transition with UW-Madison. When they are next due for a post-tenure review, UW-Madison procedures are followed, though with a hybridized set of criteria consistent with expectations of UWEX faculty applied. (It seems appropriate to apply this 1 – 6 years out from the transition rather than 0 – 5, so activities and criteria have time to be adjusted to new circumstances). For UWEX faculty integrated into existing UW-Madison departments, this would require departmental level adjustments of post tenure evaluation criteria. If UWEX faculty remain in a separate extension division, it could require additional procedures outside of the division to assure that “each faculty member’s activities and performance [is] in accordance with the mission of the department, college, and institution, and the responsibilities of the faculty (FP&P 7.17).” This option would, to an extent be determined by changes in PTR specifications, subject UWEX faculty to evaluation based on criteria and activities different than those in place when hired and tenured. It could also have provisions for conversion to academic staff for faculty who don’t want to go through a faculty-level PTR or who have reviews indicating “does not meet expectations.” This type of conversion is currently contrary to UW-Madison policies and is a form of de-tenuring, which again would be highly inequitable.